Vox dei: Referential Meaning in Beethoven's Use of the Trombone in His Symphonies[1]

David B. Levy

For Stewart Carter——colleague, friend, brass historian extraordinaire.

> It is settled that the sound of the trombone is intended solely for religious purposes, and never for the secular.
>
> *Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart*[2]

> To hear it is like being present at the work of Creation. Strange, disorderly, almost appalling, as is the rushing surface of the mass, we cannot but feel that a divine power is working under the current; the creative force of law and order is at work there; and at last, out of the suspense and mystery and repetition which have for so long enveloped us, suddenly bursts the new world, radiant with the eternal sunshine, and welcomed by the jubilant sound of those aeonian strains, when all the sons of God shouted for joy.
>
> *George Grove*[3]

> Then the trombones burst forth; the thunder of the timpani redoubles its fury. It is no longer merely a wind and rainstorm; it is a frightful cataclysm, the universal deluge, the end of the world.
>
> *Hector Berlioz*[4]

> The last movement of the symphony has three trombones and a piccolo—and, although it is true, there are not three kettledrums, yet this combination of instruments will make more noise and, what is more, a more pleasing noise than six kettledrums.
>
> *Ludwig van Beethoven*[5]

One of Beethoven's signal compositions presented during the Congress of Vienna was the secular cantata *Der glorreiche Augenblick*, op. 136, written to a text by Aloys Weißenbach and first performed before an audience of assembled diplomats and Viennese music lovers at a grand musical *Akademie* in the Imperial Royal Redoutensaal on 29 November 1814.[6] I choose the word "secular" deliberately in describing the cantata, as the spirit and orchestration of the work, most notably exhibited in its opening chorus, "Europa steht!" sounds decidedly ecclesiastical. Indeed, for all the faults that scholars have found with this work, the cantata's beginning adumbrates motivic gestures and sonorities found in the Credo of Beethoven's *Missa solemnis,* op. 123.

DOI: 10.2153/0120170011001

One of the prominent elements that gives "Europa steht" its ecclesiastical majesty is its use of trombones.[7]

Der glorreiche Augenblick, however, was not Beethoven's first attempt to use the trombone in a secular context. Everyone who has written at any length about Beethoven's Fifth, Sixth, and Ninth Symphonies has taken note of the fact that these works include trombones in their respective scoring—three in the finale of the Fifth and the Trio of the Scherzo of the Ninth, and two in the Storm and Finale of the Sixth. What has not been explored sufficiently, however, is *why* he chose to introduce trombones into these particular works. Nor have analysts explored *how* and *where* Beethoven deployed trombones in these symphonies. While it is generally acknowledged, and perhaps too obvious to mention, that Beethoven was the first *important* composer to introduce trombones into symphonies, he was not literally the first to do so. There is no evidence, however, to suggest that Beethoven knew, or was influenced by, symphonies by Joseph Krottendorfer or Ignaz Pleyel that used trombones, composed, respectively, forty and sixteen years prior to opp. 67 and 68.[8] Much more plausible and immediate influence would have been the use of the trombone in sacred and theatrical works by Christoph Willibald Gluck, Joseph Haydn, and Wolfgang Amadé Mozart, as well as the tradition of trombones in the concerted choral music of Beethoven's Vienna, including examples by Johann Joseph Fux, Georg Reutter, and Beethoven's former teacher, Johann Georg Albrechtsberger, to name but a few. Mozart's Mass in C minor, K. 427 and Requiem, K. 626 stand closer to Beethoven's first scoring for trombones.[9] Closer still are Haydn's oratorios, *Die Schöpfung* of 1798 (with its especially rewarding part for bass trombone), and *Die Jahreszeiten* (1801). Scoring for trombones in oratorios can be traced back to Heinrich Schütz and George Frideric Handel (*Israel in Egypt* and *Saul*). Handel's oratorios, as we well know, were a direct influence on Haydn's. Viennese oratorios and sepolcros from the early eighteenth century also called for trombones.

Beethoven had incorporated trombone parts on two occasions prior to the Fifth and Sixth Symphonies—three trombones in both his oratorio *Christus am Ölberg* (1803–04) and the opera *Leonore* (1804–05; the number of trombones was reduced to two in the final revision of *Leonore* as *Fidelio* in 1814). According to testimony from Ferdinand Ries, some of the trombone writing in *Christus* was apparently an afterthought.[10]

Curiously, the critics of Beethoven's day took little note of the employment of this new timbral resource in the two new symphonies that witnessed their first performances at the Akademie on 22 December 1808. As we know, excerpts from Beethoven's Mass in C and *Choral Fantasy* also were featured at this concert. The Mass, composed two years earlier, did not include trombones, but Beethoven certainly *could* have used these instruments in the newly composed *Choral Fantasy,* though he chose not to do so.[11] Early critics, most notably the oft-cited E. T. A. Hoffmann and Adolph Bernhard Marx, had no difficulty following the dramatic trajectory of the Fifth Symphony and the programmatic narrative of the Sixth, and subsequent writers have commented extensively about these works. Yet none of them have asked the question as to *why* Beethoven added trombones to his orchestra.[12] If the answer were as simple as the one offered in

the composer's letter to Count Franz von Oppersdorff—i.e., he was seeking to make "more noise"—the question seems inconsequential. Yet we do not find trombones called upon in Symphonies Seven and Eight, each of which makes plenty of noise. What I am proposing is that Beethoven's inclusion of the trombones in Symphonies Five and Six, and later the Ninth Symphony, holds cultural and narrative signification. Composing with an understanding of the specific role that the trombone played in the church and theater in Vienna and elsewhere, Beethoven the symphonist was transferring those significations into instrumental music. For Beethoven the symphonist, the trombone represented the voice of divine intervention—as it were, the voice of the Divinity (*Gottheit*) itself. The trombone was quite literally, the *vox dei*.

It would be useful here to trace briefly the roles that the trombone and trombonists held, not only in Beethoven's Vienna, but also to consider the cultural symbolism associated with this instrument from a wider historical perspective. Iconographical and other evidence suggest that at some point in the later Middle Ages and early Renaissance (i.e., ca. 1400), some forms of trumpet were used that featured an "S" shape. Over a period of years, i.e., somewhere in the fifteenth century, these instruments morphed into apparatuses with slides—the so-called "slide trumpets."[13] It was from these instruments that the trombone began to evolve. The complicated relationship between trumpets and trombones gave rise by the sixteenth century to an interesting and important confusion of nomenclature, confusion that is reflected in newly translated versions of the Bible. As Trevor Herbert points out, the Italian word *tromba*, for example, gave birth to a host of names for instruments, including *trompette*, *trombone*, and *drompten* (in the Low Countries). On the other hand, we find the Latin *busine* or *bucina* variously translated into *bason* and *Posaune*.[14] Indeed, when one looks at passages in German translations of the Bible, we consistently find the translation of the Latin *tuba* as *Posaune*. The original Latin was derived from the ancient Roman name for a kind of trumpet that was used for military purposes, but also for funeral processions, games, and religious rituals, but in Biblical contexts, often refers in most cases to the Hebrew ram's horn (shofar), although there are other references, such as the "silver trumpets" in Numbers 10:2. Here are three representative examples of the word *Posaune* in German translations of the Bible:[15]

> Und so die Posaune [tuba] einen undeutlichen Ton gibt / Wer will sich zum Streit rüsten? (1 Kor. 14:8) (For if the trumpet give an uncertain sound, who shall prepare himself to the battle?)
>
> Und der HERR wird über ihnen erscheinen / und seine Pfeile werden ausfahren / wie der Blitz; / Und der HERR HERR wird die Posaune blasen / und wird einhertreten / wie die Wetter vom Mittag. (Sacharja 9:14) (And the Lord shall be seen over them, and his arrow shall go forth as the lightning: and the Lord God shall blow the trumpet, and shall go with whirlwinds of the south.)

> Und dasselbe plötzlich in einem Augenblick / zu der Zeit der letzten Posaune. / Denn es wird die Posaune schallen / und die Todten werden auferstehen unverweslich / und wir werden verwandelt werden. (1 Kor. 15:52) (In a moment, in the twinkling of an eye, at the last trump: for the trumpet shall sound, and the dead shall be raised incorruptible, and we shall be changed.)

It is also notable that Mozart, in his Requiem, K. 626, wrote an extensive solo for trombone in his setting of the "Tuba mirum." From an etymological perspective, then, we can trace the trombone of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries as an instrument most closely associated with not only sacred ritual, but the imminent presence of the Divine, most especially with the Day of Judgment. For a secular but also numinous context, see the oracle scene of *Idomeneo*.

It hardly seems necessary to trace the long history and function of trombones as instruments that reinforce the alto, tenor, and bass lines of choral lines in concerted sacred music. The research of Otto Biba and Markus Spielmann confirms the ongoing tradition of trombones in South German and Austrian, most notably Viennese, church music well into the late eighteenth century.[16] Such usage would have been expected and understood by Beethoven and his audiences. The use of trombones in *Christus am Ölberge*, therefore, would not be out of place, even if we accept Ries's testimony that their place in the scoring of that work was an "afterthought." Trombones participate in four of the six numbers in *Christus* and David Guion has gone so far as to suggest that these instruments represent the "voice of God," citing their appearance in the introduction, "Jesus's opening recitative, an angel chorus, and the Seraph's announcement of God's will."[17] The trombone chords in no. 1 that precede the words, "Ich höre deines Seraphs Donnerstimme" (I hear your Seraph's thunderous voice) certainly support Guion's theory. Even more convincing are the solemn chords in no. 3 (Recitativo), where Jesus questions if God still holds the terror of death in store for him, to which the Seraph responds "So spricht Jehovah: Eh' nicht erfüllet ist das heilige Geheimnis der Versöhnung so lange bleibt das menschliche Geschlecht verworfen und beraubt des ew'gen Lebens." (Thus speaks Jehovah: Until atonement is made through the shedding of holy blood, mankind remains outcast and deprived of eternal life.) In this instance the trombones play a double role—a symbol of the voice of the Divine and acting out the traditional role of the instrument to represent the topic of the *ombra*. The best-known moment from Beethoven's only oratorio is the pair of choruses no. 6, the *Maestoso*, "Welten singen Dank und Ehre," and ensuing *Allegro*, "Preiset ihn, ihr Engelchöre," replete with trombones that are remarkably free from the role of doubling the choral lines. Taken all in all, little of the scoring for trombones in *Christus am Ölberge* deviates from the traditional and conservative role that these instruments played in the sacred choral music of its time.

The other piece by Beethoven that predates the Fifth and Sixth Symphonies is the opera *Leonore* in both its original version of 1805, which includes the *Leonore Overture no. 2*, and its first revision of 1806, including the *Leonore Overture no. 3*. Both of these *Leonore Overtures* use three trombones.[18] The *Fidelio Overture* of 1814 calls for two trombones (tenor and bass). I cannot say at this point what may have influenced Beethoven in his scoring for trombones in *Leonore*, but in the 1814 final revision (i.e., *Fidelio*), Beethoven uses trombones in their sepulchral role, as we observed in no. 3 from *Christus*, in the Rocco/Leonore duet from Act II, "Nun hurtig fort, nun frisch gegraben."[19] Likely models for both works were provided by operas by Gluck and Mozart, although the tradition of the trombone as a representative of the underworld extends back much further.[20] We need look no further for evidence than the famous cemetery scene and finale of Act II from Mozart's *Don Giovanni*, where the reference to the Divine and to heavenly judgment is explicit. So, too, does the sound of trombones evoke the benevolent voice of the Divine in *Die Zauberflöte*. Indeed, one could go so far as to say that the trombone is the instrument *par excellence* entrusted to represent Sarastro and his Priestly Temple of Wisdom. In this opera, the Divine is freed from its purely Christian context, allowing it to merge almost seamlessly with the ideals of the Enlightenment and Freemasonry. Yet the trombones' mere presence evokes the world of the sacred. Keeping this context in mind, it is quite reasonable and consistent to view the freeing of Florestan as involving Divine intervention, even if Leonore's human courage also remains an indispensable element in his liberation.[21]

The beginning of the present article cites Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart's dictum that the sound of the trombone belongs solely to the realm of the religious, and has no role to play in the world of the secular (*profane*). Schubart asserts that "Diess Instrument [die Posaune] ist durch Jahrtausende nie profanirt worden; sondern immer gleichsam als ein Erbtheil dem Tempel Gottes geblieben."[22] (This instrument has not been profaned for centuries; but rather always remained the inheritance of God's Temple.) Rita Steblin and Klaus-Jürgen Sachs have written about Beethoven's familiarity with Schubart's theory of the characteristics of tonality found in his *Ideen zu einer Aesthetik der Tonkunst*.[23] Although Beethoven disagreed with some of Schubart's conclusions, he nevertheless possessed a copy of the *Aesthetik* in his personal library and had cause to refer to it from time to time. We can be certain that Beethoven knew Schubart's pronouncements about the place of the trombone even without hard evidence of what he actually thought about it.

Trombones in the Pastoral Symphony

As we know, the Akademie of 1808 began with the Pastoral Symphony, represented as Symphony no. 5 on the concert handbill, complete with Beethoven's titles for each of its five movements. In the *Pastoral* Symphony, the scoring for trombones is withheld until the climax of the thunderstorm, marked *fortissimo* in m. 106, 4th beat, and continuing at the same level of intensity through the first beat of m. 119, after which the rest of the orchestra begins a *sempre diminuendo*, indicative of the fact that

the storm was beginning to pass, never again to recover its prior fury.[24] If Beethoven was interested solely in making a loud noise, this brief but effective entrance of the trombones certainly accomplishes the task. As a musical model for the storm itself, Beethoven invokes the music that opened Act I, scene 1 of his earlier ballet, *Die Geschöpfe des Prometheus*. Regarding the specific writing for trombones he most likely had been thinking of the thunderstorm that erupts with similar ferocity in "Sommer" from Haydn's *Die Jahreszeiten*.

Maynard Solomon, in his biography of the composer, posits that the "storm" movement represents "Fate" intruding on the merry-making of the peasants "as the thunderous voice of the God of wrath."[25] But what, more specifically, might the outburst of trombones at the height of "Thunder. Storm" in the Pastoral Symphony signify? What I propose here is that this is the precise moment of Divine intervention, whereby the storm is commanded by a heavenly voice—i.e., the trombones—to dissipate. But the voice of the Divinity—a fearful voice at the climax of storm—has yet to make its final statement. As David Wyn Jones points out, the voice of the trombone, unlike that of the piccolo and timpani, does not fall silent in the final movement of the Pastoral Symphony, but remains as a presence throughout the "Beneficent feeling after the storm joined with thanks to the deity" as was stated on the handbill that was distributed to the audience at the 1808 Akademie.[26] Gustav Nottebohm and later Dagmar Weise brought to our attention Beethoven's entry in the sketchbook known as Landsberg 10, namely the inscription in sketches for the finale, "Ausdruck des Danks[.] O Herr wir danken dir."[27] Other references to the finale also reside in the Bodmer Collection of the Beethoven-Haus and in Grasnick 3, which also was researched by Weise, and which contains the notation "Ruhm sej Gott in der Höh im *Kirchenstil* heilig im *Kirchenstil*."[28] Kirby's identification of the Pastoral Symphony as a "characteristic symphony" was taken up in far greater detail by Richard Will in Chapter Four of his monograph on this genre.[29] Will calls the Pastoral Symphony an "orchestral representation of Paradise," in which the "sublimity of the storm [is matched by] a religious tone suggestive of a community inspired by the terror to redeem itself.… The inhabitants of Beethoven's countryside … face a crisis, but they survive thanks not to their own deeds but to the apparent intervention of a higher power."[30] Beethoven's special fondness for Christoph Christian Sturm's 1785 *Betrachtungen über die Werke Gottes im Reiche der Natur* (*Reflections on the Works of God in the Realm of Nature*), lends further credence to the religious overtones of the Pastoral Symphony. Will devotes much of the remainder of his chapter on the Pastoral Symphony to its religious dimensions, as reflected in characteristic symphonies by Paul Wranitzky, Justin Heinrich Knecht, and others, but only once mentions the use of trombones in a passing reference to their power in the storm.[31] How could the inclusion of trombones in the hymn of thanksgiving be interpreted in any other way than as a symbol for the Divine presence?

Trombones in the Fifth Symphony

I need not point out here the many structural parallels between the Pastoral Symphony and the Fifth, the most frequently cited in the extensive literature being the linkage of the scherzo (mediated by the storm in the case of the Pastoral) with the finale. It is useful, nevertheless, to observe that in the case of both symphonies, each segue takes the listener from a moment of crisis and terror to a victory—one reverential, the other triumphal—over these feelings. In the case of the Fifth Symphony the trombones, along with the contrabassoon and piccolo, are held in reserve until the finale, and, unlike the Pastoral Symphony, do not play a role in the terror of the scherzo itself. The other important difference between the Pastoral and the Fifth Symphony is that while the former is unabashedly programmatic, the latter is not. Of course this is not to say that programs have not been invented to find or impose meaning on this the most famous of Beethoven's symphonies, as narrative interpretations sprang up almost immediately after it was published in 1809. Those who have written of the heroic aspects of the *Allegro* finale of the Fifth Symphony have focused primarily on the martial nature of its triadic opening theme, in which all the additional instruments, trombones included, participate. I shall not argue against the obvious fact that the trombones in particular add both weight and sonic power to this regal opening. What I wish to suggest, however, is the idea that here too, as in the Pastoral Symphony, the presence of a Divine intercession is at play, both in its expression of Divine grace after the peril of the scherzo, but also as an agent of alarm at the height of peril that unfolds in the finale's development section. While the trombones at the beginning of the finale add a new domain of Divine benevolence to the spirit of triumphal affirmation, it could also be said to represent Divine intercession at the climax of the development section.

Many analysts have taken note of two relevant features. Firstly, the martial theme that opens the finale has no role to play in its development section. Secondly, Beethoven focuses his attention in the development solely on the second theme group, first heard in the exposition beginning on the fourth beat of m. 44. What often escapes the notice of auditors in the exposition, however, is the figure in the cellos that begins on the fourth beat of m. 46 and which continues through the first beat of m. 48. Beethoven elevates this seemingly innocent secondary line to tremendous prominence in the development section. The figure begins to take on a sinister and threatening tone in the cellos, basses, and contrabassoon beginning with the anacrusis to m. 107. This passage is tonally unstable, and the reentry of the first and second trombones on the fourth beat of m. 112, now doubled by the bassoons, gives the figure a more threatening tone. I suggest that this is that same voice of the Divine, analogous to what we experience at the climax of the storm of the Pastoral Symphony. If my reading is correct, that same figure starting in m. 303 of the coda, now cloaked in the blinding light of an unequivocal C Major, is transformed into a voice of Divine affirmation.

It is no coincidence that Beethoven called for trombones in both symphonies that inaugurated each half of his 1808 Akademie. As Raymond Knapp, writing of the finale of the Fifth Symphony and the final two movements of the Sixth, observes, it

is in "the trombone, according to long-standing traditions, we may often find at once the presence of God and the instrument most befitting his worship".[32]

What is less clear is why Beethoven called for three trombones in the C-Minor Symphony, but only two in the F-Major work, given the fact that three trombonists had to be available for the concert. My best guess is that the weight of a third, and lower-pitched trombone would not have fit comfortably into the sonic world of the gentler Pastoral Symphony. In both works, nevertheless, the cultural association of the trombone is clearly in evidence. No other work on the concert program called for trombones, not even the newly composed *Choral Fantasy*, a work in which trombones would not have seemed out of place, even as its text reads at the end, "All mankind is rewarded by the favor of the gods" ("Lohnt dem Menschen Götter-Gunst"). The favor of the "gods," one might conclude, is not the same as the one Divine voice, the *vox dei*.

Trombones in the Ninth Symphony

Beethoven wrote several works calling for trombones that postdate the 1808 Akademie. Among these we may count the *Three Equali* for four trombones, *Märsche und Tänze für Militärmusik*, WoO 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, and 24, incidental music for *The Ruins of Athens* and *König Stephan, Ungarns erster Wohltäter,* the orchestral version of *Wellington's Victory*, the aforementioned cantata composed for the Congress of Vienna, *Der glorreiche Augenblick*, and the patriotic choral work *Es ist vollbracht*. Beethoven's final compositions that include trombones are the overture *Die Weihe des Hauses* (used only in the introduction), the *Missa solemnis*, and the Ninth Symphony. I will turn my attention now to the last of these works.

While much time had elapsed between 1808 and the completion of the Ninth Symphony in 1824, Beethoven's purpose for employing the trombone had not changed. These instruments present themselves prominently in both the second and fourth movements. The first time we hear the sound of the trombone comes at the onset of the D-Major trio of the second movement, where the third trombone intones the tonic note (m. 414). The trombones remain idle until mm. 475ff, where the third trombone returns to punctuate and reinforce the cellos and contrabasses. It continues in m. 491, joined later by the other trombones (mm. 501–29), i.e., to the end of the trio. As I have written elsewhere, the trio section of this scherzo movement is evocative of the world of the pastoral, a mood invoked not only by its slow harmonic rhythm, but by its invocation of the rustic musette.[33] The choir of trombones now assumes a hymnal quality, joined by all the other instruments except for a pedal tone in the contrabasses. The context of this passage (musette with trombones) evokes the world of "God in nature," no less so than the final two movements of the Sixth Symphony, symbolizing once again a Divine intervention in the midst of the harsh and tumultuous world. The voice of the third trombone returns in the brief codetta, where Beethoven leads the listener to believe that the pastoral world has been regained.[34] Of course it has not.

The trombones remain *tacet* throughout the entire third movement, although the 12/8 variation occupies the same spiritual world as the finale of the Pastoral Symphony.

They are not used in the finale of the Ninth Symphony until m. 594. Here we arrive at the invocation, marked *Andante maestoso*, of the "Seid umschlungen Millionen," followed by the *Adagio ma non troppo ma divoto*, "Ihr stürtzt nieder, Millionen?" As was the case with the trio of the scherzo, the third trombone voice leads. If what I have said about the sound of the trombone being emblematic of the Divine presence in the Pastoral and Fifth Symphonies may strike the reader as conjectural, surely the symbolism of introducing the voice of the trombone in this, the most overtly religious passage of the Ninth Symphony, cannot be dismissed. The deployment of the trombones in the *Allegro energico e sempre ben marcato* double fugue, returns to the most traditional of all roles for the instrument in sacred music—that of the doubling instruments for the choral voices.

Here at last, now, the ideal world—call it heaven or Elysium—has finally been obtained. How, then, could the instrumental representative of the Divine voice not be present? In the three symphonies in which Beethoven wrote for the trombone, he experimented boldly not only in expanding the sonic world of the symphony, but by infusing the world of the sacred into what had traditionally been a secular domain. While the cultural associations of the trombone in early nineteenth-century Vienna may have passed out of the public consciousness after Beethoven, the authoritative sound of this instrument certainly had not. That the sound of the trombone could still be associated with the world of the sacred in symphonies certainly did not escape the attention of Berlioz and Schumann, to name but two. The fact that Beethoven was the first to do so opened the door for the trombone to become a regular member of orchestra, even if it no longer was expected to behave as a bridge between the sacred and the secular.

Musicologist David B. Levy is Professor of Music at Wake Forest University. He has conducted research and published extensively on the works of Beethoven and is the author of Beethoven: the Ninth Symphony (*Yale University Press, 2003). He is working on a new book on all nine symphonies of Beethoven.*

Notes

[1] This paper was originally published under the title "From the Church and Theater into the Concert Hall: Referential Meaning in Beethoven's Use of the Trombone in his Symphonies" in *Beethoven und der Wiener Kongress (1814/15): Bericht über die vierte New Beethoven Research Conference Bonn, 10. bis 12. September 2014,* Schriften zur Beethoven-Forschung 26 (Bonn, 2016). It is reprinted here under its new title with permission from the Verlag Beethoven-Haus Bonn.

[2] "Ausgemacht ist, dass der Posaunenton ganz für die Religion und nie fürs Profane gestimmt ist." Christian Friedrich Daniel Schubart, *Ideen zu einer Aesthetik der Tonkunt* (Vienna, 1806), 317. Translated by the author.

[3] George Grove, *Beethoven and his Nine Symphonies* (London 1898), 172.

[4] "Alors les trombones éclatent, le tonnerre des timbales redouble de violence; ce n'est plus de la pluie, du vent, c'est un cataclysme épouvantable, le deluge universel, la fin du monde." (Hector Berlioz, *A travers chants: Études musicales, adorations, boutades et critiques* [Paris, 1862], 38.) Translated by the author.

[5] Ludwig van Beethoven, letter to Count Franz von Oppersdorff, Oberglogau in Silesia, Vienna, March, 1808, in Emily Anderson, *The Letters of Beethoven* (London: Macmillan, 1986), 166. See also *Ludwig van Beethoven Briefwechsel Gesamtausgabe*, Bd. 2, ed. Sieghard Brandenburg (Munich: G. Henle Verlag, 1996), no. 325.

[6] The concert was repeated two more times, on 2 and 25 December.

[7] I thank John David Wilson for bringing this feature to my attention.

[8] See Daniel R. Cloutier, "Ludwig van Beethoven's Orchestration of the Trombone" (Ph.D. diss., West Virginia University, 2009), 12.

[9] Beethoven seems have shown no interest in the kind of virtuoso writing for trombone that was cultivated in Salzburg and placed on exhibit in the "Tuba mirum" of Mozart's Requiem.

[10] See Alan Tyson, "The 1803 Version of Beethoven's Christus am Oelberge," *Musical Quarterly* 56 (1970): 551–84, here 559, n. 11. Beethoven, in a letter to Peter von Braun dated 4 May 1806, requests retrieval of the trombone parts for *Fidelio* from the archives of the Theater an der Wien in order to enter them, along with the first flute and four horns, into the score. The composer had not allowed enough room in the full score and mentions that Prince Lobkowitz had requested the score for a possible performance of *Leonore* at his palace. See *Ludwig van Beethovens, Briefwechsel Gesamtausgabe,* Bd. 1, ed. Sieghard Brandenburg (Munich: G. Henle Verlag, 1996), no. 251.

[11] See Theodore Albrecht, "Beethoven's Portrait of the Theater an der Wien's Orchestra in His Choral Fantasy, Op. 80," in *Beiträge zu Biographie und Schaffensprozess bei Beethoven: Rainer Cadenbach zum Gedenken,* ed. Jürgen May, Schriften zur Beethoven-Forschung 21 (Bonn: Beethoven-Haus, 2011), 1–26, here 13. Albrecht argues that trombones may have participated in the performances of the Mass and Choral Fantasy, although no parts survive and trombones are not called for in the published versions of either work.

[12] David Wyn Jones, *Beethoven: "Pastoral Symphony"* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 53, hints at a possible religious connection between the use of trombones and the program of op. 68.

[13] See Trevor Herbert, *The Trombone* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2006), 52–56.

[14] Ibid., 56–60.

[15] *Das Neue Testament unsers Herrn und Heilandes Jesu Christi, verdeutscht von D. Martin Luther* (Stuttgart: S.G. Liesching, 1840), 216 and 219; and *Lutherbibel 1912*, http://bibeltext.com/zechariah/9-14.htm (accessed May 2014). All English translations are from the King James Version.

[16] Otto Biba, "Die Wiener Kirchenmusik um 1783," *Beiträge zur Musikgeschichte des 18. Jahrhunderts. Jahrbuch für österreichische Kulturgeschichte*, Bd. 1, Halbbd. 2 (1971): 7–79; Markus Spielmann, "Der Zink im Instrumentarium des süddeutsch-österreichischen Raumes 1650–1750, " in *Johann Joseph Fux und die barocke Bläsertradition—Kongressbericht Graz, 1985*, ed. Bernhard Habla (Tutzing: H. Schneider, 1987), 121–55.

[17] David Guion, *The Trombone: Its History and Music, 1697-1811* (New York: Gordon and Breach, 1988), 223.

[18] The overture known as *Leonore no. 1* does not call for trombones.

[19] See Michael C. Tusa, "Beethoven and Opera: The Grave-digging Duet in Leonore (1805)," *Beethoven Forum* 5 (1996): 1–63, here 6, where, quoting the article "Singstük" from the 2nd

edition of Sulzer's *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste*, we find the admonition that "3) A skillful selection of accompanying instruments as well as of the manner of accompaniment must be made in accordance with the tone of the passion that is to be represented." ("Unter der begleitenden Instrumenten sowol, als in der Art der Begleitung, muß nach dem Ton der vorzustellenden Leidenschaft eine geschikte Auswahl getroffen werden."), transl. Tusa. I thank William Kinderman for bringing Tusa's article to my attention.

[20] One thinks here of Claudio Monteverdi's *L'Orfeo* of 1607. See also John Spitzer and Neal Zaslaw, *The Birth of the Orchestra: History of an Institution, 1650–1815* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), 31.

[21] The trombones do appear strategically at the *fortissimo* climax of the "Er sterbe" ensemble, confirming Florestan's rescue as an act not only of Leonore's heroism, but of Divine intervention.

[22] Schubart, *Ideen*, 315. To the best of my knowledge, no writers except for Roland Schmenner, *Die Pastorale: Beethoven, das Gewitter, und der Blitzableiter* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1998), 207–08; and David M. Guion, *The Trombone*, 83–86, have taken note of Schubart's statement.

[23] Rita Steblin, *A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1983), and Klaus-Jürgen Sachs, "Zur Tonartencharakteristik," in *Beethovens Klaviervariationen op. 34*, mit Beiträgen von Mark Lindley, Conny Restle, and Klaus-Jürgen Sachs (Mainz: Schott, 2007), 58–79.

[24] Ludwig van Beethoven, *Symphonie Nr. 6 in F-dur*, ed. Jonathan Del Mar (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1998), 92; *Neue Beethoven Ausgabe* I/3, ed. Jens Dufner (Munich: G. Henle, 2013), 177ff. In both editions the trombones have a diminuendo in m. 118 leading to the dynamic *p* in m. 119.

[25] Maynard Solomon, *Beethoven* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1998), 267.

[26] "Wohltätige, mit Dank an die Gottheit verbundene Gefühle nach dem Sturm." See Jones, *Beethoven: Pastoral Symphony*, 52ff.

[27] Dagmar Weise, *Ein Skizzenbuch zur Pastoralsymphonie Op. 68*, 2 vols. (Bonn: Beethovenhaus, 1961), 1:17; and Gustav Nottebohm, *Zweite Beethoviana: Nachgelassene Aufsätze* (Leipzig: C. F. Peters, 1887), 375. These observations are reaffirmed by F[rank] E[ugene] Kirby, "Beethoven's Pastoral Symphony as a 'Sinfonia caracteristica'," *Musical Quarterly* 56 (1970): 605–23, here 618.

[28] Cited in ibid., 619. Italics mine.

[29] Richard Will, "Paradise regained: Time, Morality, and Humanity in Beethoven's 'Pastoral' Symphony," in *The Characteristic Symphony in the Age of Haydn and Beethoven* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 156–87.

[30] Ibid., 156ff.

[31] Ibid., 179.

[32] Raymond Knapp, "A Tale of Two Symphonies: Converging Narratives of Divine Reconciliation in Beethoven's Fifth and Sixth," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 53 (2000): 291–343, here 340.

[33] David Benjamin Levy, *Beethoven: The Ninth Symphony*, rev. edn. (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2003), 74ff.

[34] The hint of a second return of the trio is consistent with the five-part design of the scherzos of the Fourth, Sixth, and Seventh Symphonies. I leave aside the much discussed issue of the structure of the third movement of the Fifth Symphony.